

# National Genealogical Society Quarterly



Identifying the Children of  
David Pugh and Nancy Minton of  
Virginia, Kentucky, and Tennessee  
By Daniela Moneta, CG  
Volume 96, No. 1, March 2008

The  
National Genealogical Society

presents . . .

# Faces of America

On the Cover:

DAVID LEE PUGH (1835–1907)

MARY FRANCIS (NÉE WHITSON) PUGH (1849–1904)

David and Mary Pugh's lives probably typified those of many Americans in the 1800s. With his parents David migrated westward from Virginia to Missouri, where he met and married Mary, whose parents were Kentucky and Tennessee natives. David worked as a farmer and carpenter, and Mary was a homemaker. In their middle age the couple settled in Kansas. Late in life they moved from country to town. David, who had fought as a private on the Union side in the Civil War, received a pension for his service. He and Mary kept a family Bible—one without publication or copyright date—in which they recorded eight children's births.

Detail concerning this Bible's provenance strikes an unusual note in the couple's life. On 25 July 1904 David described its acquisition, perhaps revealing a helpful practice among Bible salesmen:

I have in my possession a family bible that contains a record of the births and deaths in my family, copied therein in 1883 by a Mr. Maddox from whom the bible was bought, about ten miles from Plattsburg, Clinton county, Mo., from the record in my father's family bible. . . . I do not know what became of the original family bible.

The early entries' handwriting suggests Maddox copied several names and dates into the family Bible record. Exactly one month after David's statement a county clerk affirmed that the Bible "does not bear any date showing when it was printed." She described it as "an old one with the back loose and showing every sign of age."

The salesman's identity is uncertain. The 1880 census lists John Maddox seven households away from David and Mary Pugh. A farmer, he might have sold Bibles as a sideline. In any case, "Mr. Maddox" began a record bridging two hundred years and five generations from David's father—the name Maddox first entered—to the Bible's present owner.

## Credits:

The creator of the photograph, a tintype, is unknown. The picture and Bible are in the care of Pugh descendant Jack Query; 6209 NW 83rd Street, Oklahoma City, OK 73132-4632; jackquery@sbcglobal.net. Quotations are from David L. Pugh and Lena M. Pfeifer, respectively, affidavits in David L. Pugh (Pvt. Co. F, 4th Provisional Enrolled Mo. Militia Regt., and Co. B, 89th Enrolled Mo. Militia Regt., Civil War) pension no. S.C. 925,657; Case Files of Approved Pension Applications . . . 1861–1934; Civil War and Later Pension Files; Department of Veterans Affairs, RG 15; National Archives, Washington, D.C. Other documentation is in Mr. Query's files and those of Daniela Monera, CG; 1062 East Pueblo Road, Phoenix, AZ 85020; Daniela@GenealogyOne-on-One.com. For information on David Lee Pugh's paternal ancestry, see "Identifying the Children of David Pugh and Nancy Minton" in this issue.

---

## Identifying the Children of David Pugh and Nancy Minton of Virginia, Kentucky, and Tennessee

---

By Daniela Moneta, CG

*Undocumented information in a cryptic booklet by an anonymous compiler  
unites relatives who may otherwise have never found one another.*

Genealogists condemn undocumented family histories, which often contain errors disguised as credible information. With leaps of faith, myth, incorrectly merged identities, chronological impossibilities, and other paradoxes, they can mislead. They can be useful, nevertheless, as undocumented information may point to reliable sources. When corroborated, such genealogies may offer solid evidence of a family or relationship. An undocumented family history naming David Pugh's children does just that.

David Pugh's life, except its middle years, was a mystery. He purchased land in 1792 in what is now Grayson County, Virginia.<sup>1</sup> About 1806 he headed for "remote parts," leaving his wife and eight children behind.<sup>2</sup> By June 1823 word of David's death reached his wife, Sarah, and she received her dower share of property in Grayson County.<sup>3</sup> Descendants knew about the sixteen years preceding David's departure, but why did he leave? Where did he go?

### A VENTURE INTO REMOTE PARTS

An incident before August 1806 provoked David's leaving. Acting as Sarah's representative, her brother Shadrack Greer, "not a lawyer but a big landowner and influential citizen," brought charges against David and a local woman,

---

© Daniela Moneta, CG; 1062 East Pueblo Road; Phoenix, AZ 85020; Daniela@GenealogyOne-on-One.com. Ms. Moneta, who earned her Masters of Library and Information Science at the University of California, Los Angeles, has worked as a librarian and archivist for more than twenty-five years and authored several books. She teaches family history at Arizona State University.

1. Wythe Co., Va., Deed Book 1:103, Cox to Pew, 1 May 1792; County Court, Wytheville, Va.; microfilm 34,231, Family History Library (FHL), Salt Lake City. Grayson County was formed from Wythe County on 1 May 1793. See "An act for dividing the county of Wythe," in William Waller Hening, ed., *The Statutes at Large . . . of Virginia . . .*, 13 vols. (1823; reprint, Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia, 1969), 13:559–61.

2. Grayson Co., Va., Deed Book 2:227–28, Pew to his children, 27 August 1806; County Court, Independence, Va.; FHL microfilm 31,746.

3. Grayson Co. Will Book 1:276, Dower assignment to Sarah Pugh, 21 June 1823; County Court, Independence, Va.; FHL microfilm 31,741.

Nancy Minton.<sup>4</sup> A justice of the peace ordered David to jail for “failing to give security to be of good behavior and to keep the peace toward the citizens of the Commonwealth and especially toward Sarah his wife.” A one-thousand-dollar bond for David’s freedom was conditioned upon “good behavior for . . . one year or be in custody until he comply with the order.” Similarly charged, Nancy Minton had bond set at fifty dollars.<sup>5</sup> The court ordered the sheriff to confine them to separate jail cells.<sup>6</sup>

Nancy Minton reportedly had lived on David and Sarah’s property, probably on ninety acres of the original David Pugh land at Mouth of Wilson, Virginia. Only old-fashioned jonquils bloom where David’s house probably stood. A pile of chimney rocks on a corner of the property marks the site of Nancy’s cabin.<sup>7</sup>

Divorce was difficult to obtain in the early 1800s. Like other Southern states, Virginia had no divorce code and courts lacked jurisdiction. Legislatures heard petitions and rejected most of them, granting divorce only in extreme circumstances.<sup>8</sup> The Pughs’ situation was not unusual, and no source indicates Sarah or David sought divorce.

In any case, David decided—or perhaps was pressured—to leave Virginia. On 27 August 1806 and “about to travel to remote parts,” David “judged it expedient to dispose of his estate before he sets out.” He signed a document saying he granted to his children, “William, Samuel, Robert, John, Susanna, Rhode, Violet and Ruth [Pugh, and unto] the said Philip Gains (as trustee as aforesaid [for his wife Sarah Pugh]) . . . [except] all his cash, all his notes and obligations demanding cash<sub>ly</sub> One Negro man named Henry, One horse being the riding horse of the said David, his saddle, his gun, and his wearing apparel, which the said David Pew reserves to his own use.”<sup>9</sup>

Family tradition says he also took a gallon of seed corn.<sup>10</sup> David further stipulated that his children be paid off as they arrived at “full age,” and he wanted

4. Grayson Co. Order Book 1806–11, unpaginated, fourth page, Pew-Minton court order, 27 August 1806; County Court, Independence, Va.; FHL microfilm 31,753. For Sarah and Shadrack’s parentage, see Grayson Co. Will Book 1:18–19, William Greer will, 3 November 1802. Shadrack Greer, “Gentleman,” became Justice of the Peace of Chancery on 7 September 1793. See Grayson Co. Court Order Book 1793–94, second unnumbered page between pp. 23 and 24, Shadrack Greer oath recorded; FHL microfilm 31,753. Quotation is from Minnie Hall to author, letter, 14 April 2004. Ms. Hall, a descendant of David Pugh, is deceased.

5. Grayson Co. Order Book 1806–11, unpaginated, fourth page, Pew-Minton court order, 27 August 1806.

6. *Ibid.*, eighth page.

7. Hall to author, letter, 14 April 2004. This information was told to Ms. Hall as a child by her great-aunt Martha Wells Sebastian, now deceased, who knew the house’s location. Ms. Hall inherited David Pugh’s land through the Wells family.

8. Thomas E. Buckley, *The Great Catastrophe of My Life: Divorce in the Old Dominion* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2002), 14.

9. Grayson Co. Deed Book 2:227–28, Pew to his children, 27 August 1806.

10. Phyllis Parker, Ft. Branch, Indiana, to author, letter, 15 January 1999.

the youngest five to “receive a similar education” as the others.<sup>11</sup> Probably by 17 October 1807 David had left Grayson County.<sup>12</sup>

To Virginians in the early 1800s “remote parts” usually meant less settled parts of Kentucky and Tennessee. David left a paper trail in both states. In 1807 and 1808 he paid taxes in Knox County, Kentucky.<sup>13</sup> In late 1808 David gave power of attorney to John Berry of Knox County to conduct David’s business during his absence.<sup>14</sup> In 1809 “David Pew of Knoxville [sic] County, Kentucky” purchased one hundred ten acres in adjacent Claiborne County, Tennessee.<sup>15</sup> His Virginia seed corn would have done well there, because the crop thrived in Tennessee hills.<sup>16</sup>

Over the next two decades and apparently without legal troubles, David appears in Claiborne County records:

- In 1812 he witnessed his neighbor’s land purchase.<sup>17</sup>
- In 1818 the court ordered David and his neighbors to work on a road inspection defining the line between several Tennessee and Kentucky counties at the Virginia state line.<sup>18</sup>
- In November 1819 he purchased one acre in Claiborne County.<sup>19</sup>

In 1822, nearing his life’s end, David sold Nancy Minton “her heirs and assigns” all his known property. For one hundred dollars and “for and in consideration of his Maintenance as long as he lives” she received the one hundred ten acres he

11. Grayson Co. Deed Book 2:227–28, Pew to his children, 27 August 1806.

12. Grayson Co. Will Book 1:52, David Pugh estate appraisal. On 17 October 1807 the court ordered that David’s property left in trust be divided among his wife and children.

13. Knox Co. tax books, 1800–12, Kentucky State Historical Society, Frankfort, David Pugh; FHL microfilm 8,099.

14. Knox Co. Record of Deeds B:44, Clerk of the County Court, Barbourville, Ky., Pugh to Berry power of attorney, 14 November 1808; FHL microfilm 532,664.

15. Claiborne Co., Tenn., Deed Book B:220, “Lorder” [Sowder] to Pew, 22 September 1809; Register’s Office, Tazewell, Tenn. Knox County was split on 15 February 1867 to form Bell County, which borders the Tennessee state line. See “An act to establish the county of Josh Bell,” in *Journal of the Adjourned Session of 1865–6 of the House of Representatives of the Commonwealth of Kentucky* . . . (Frankfort: 1867), 456. The author thanks Ginger Ballard, historian at the Grayson County Historical Society, for finding the first clue that David Pugh had settled in Tennessee.

16. William E. Ellis, “Moonshine,” *The Tennessee Encyclopedia of History and Culture* (<http://tennesseencyclopedia.net/> : accessed 12 December 2004).

17. Claiborne Co. Deed Book D:361–62, Wallen to Jones, 3 October 1812; FHL microfilm 464,083.

18. Historical Records Project (Tennessee), comp., “Records of Claiborne County: Minutes of Pleas and Quarter Sessions; 1818–1819,” typescript, 1938, Tennessee State Archives, p. 17; FHL microfilm 1,730,834. The orders, dated 9 and 10 February 1818, affected Pugh, Thomas Vandevanter, George Gallihorn, Michael Turnage, and Christian Plank.

19. Historical Records Project (Tennessee), comp., “Records of Claiborne County: Minutes of Pleas and Quarter Sessions; 1819–1821,” typescript, 1938, Tennessee State Archives, p. 19, McNeal to Pugh proof of deed, 10 November 1819.

purchased in 1809, including his house and grist mill.<sup>20</sup> Nancy paid fifty dollars more for his personal property, including an eighty-four gallon still, tubs, and all vessels, three beds, household furniture, hogs, cows, and tools.<sup>21</sup> David also deeded Nancy the acre he purchased in 1819.<sup>22</sup> Court minutes for 4 February 1822 refer to a fifty-acre tract David deeded Nancy, but Claiborne County deeds do not record David's purchasing the land, his deeding it to Nancy, and her selling it.<sup>23</sup> In any case, David's transfers ensured Nancy's title to his Tennessee property and prevented Sarah and their children from inheriting it.<sup>24</sup>

In 1825 Nancy sold the one hundred ten acres she had received from David.<sup>25</sup> As "Nancy Pugh" in 1830 and "Nancy Minton" in 1840, she continued living in Claiborne County.<sup>26</sup> In 1833 and 1834 Lovina Minton "one of the poor of this county was let to Nancy Minton" for six dollars for three months and ten dollars for six months.<sup>27</sup> Nancy also was "lowest bidder" for keeping Lucinda Minton.<sup>28</sup> Possibly Claiborne County helped Nancy support her own or a relative's children.

#### DAVID'S SECOND FAMILY?

An anonymous compiler, in *John Wells and Descendants*, provides the date—11 February 1822—of David Pugh's death. No introduction explains why the booklet was written or how the information was gathered, no narrative places

---

20. Claiborne Co. Deed Book G:153–54, Pugh to Minton, 30 January 1822.

21. Ibid., pp. 154–55, Pugh to Minton, 30 January 1822.

22. Ibid., pp. 162–3, Pugh to Minton, 4 February 1822.

23. Claiborne County Minutes, 1821–1824, p. 47, Pugh to Minton court order, 11 February 1822; Court of Pleas and Quarter Sessions, Tazewell, Tenn.; FHL microfilm 898,397. For the negative search, see Claiborne Co. Index to Deeds (1801–1910); FHL microfilm 898,403.

24. Sarah did not have a dower right to David's Tennessee land. Following North Carolina, from which Tennessee was formed, the state did not recognize common-law dower; Tennessee wives' dower rights applied only to land their husbands possessed at death. Consequently, Tennessee land sales during the husband's lifetime did not need a dower release. For the North Carolina law and its applicability to Tennessee, see Charles H. Scribner, *A Treatise on the Law of Dower*, 2nd ed., 2 vols. (Philadelphia: T. and J. W. Johnson, 1883), 1:37.

25. Nancy sold Abraham Vanderventer the 110 acres in 1825. See Claiborne Co. Minutes, 1821–25, p. 396, Court of Pleas and Quarter Sessions; FHL microfilm 898,397. Claiborne County Deed Book H, in which this transaction may have been recorded, is missing. Also, the transaction does not appear in Claiborne Co. Index to Deeds (1801–1910).

26. 1830 U.S. census, Claiborne Co., Tenn., p. 121, Nancy Pugh; National Archives (NA) microfilm M19, roll 180. 1840 U.S. census, Claiborne Co., Tenn., p. 235A, Nancy Minton; NA microfilm M704, roll 235.

27. Claiborne Co., Minutes, 1833–36, pp. 19, 116, and 119, Nancy Minton; FHL microfilm 898,398, item 2.

28. Ibid., pp. 47, 79, and 173, Nancy Minton. On p. 79, "Lovena" is crossed out and "Lucinda" written in its place.

details in context, and no citation documents any fact.<sup>29</sup> The work contains numerous typographical errors.<sup>30</sup> Nevertheless, this cryptic publication united Pugh descendants unknown to one another before it surfaced in 1999.<sup>31</sup> The little book lists David's parents, his siblings, his wife Sarah, and their eight children. It provides information on six other children with Minton surnames:

"Polly Minton—Born February 4, 1905 [sic; apparently should be 1805].

"Franklin Pugh Minton—Born February 9, 1807.

"Elizabeth P. Minton—Born November 20, 1808.

"Thirza [sic] Minton—Born April 20, 1801.

"Washington P. Minton—Born May 6, 1813.

"Sevinak P. Minton—[no date]"<sup>32</sup>

One Pugh descendant believed them to be children of Nancy Minton and David Pugh, who had left his wife and family in 1806.<sup>33</sup> Chronology and naming suggest all but the eldest two were their children—"Thirza" (probably Thirza and listed out of chronological order) and Polly have no "Pugh" or *P* initial in their names. "Sevinak" could be a typographical error or misreading for "Levinah"—referring to Lovina Minton, the child Nancy housed in 1833 and 1834. Does documentation identify the four youngest as David Pugh and Nancy Minton's offspring?

#### RELATIONSHIPS

Two or three "Pugh Minton" children appear in other records. Original sources suggest their connections to David Pugh and Nancy Minton.

Franklin Pugh settled in Missouri apparently in 1854.<sup>34</sup> The birth date on his gravestone matches that of "Franklin Pugh Minton" in *John Wells and*

29. *John Wells and Descendants* (Orchard, Neb.: privately printed, 1930[?]), 4. Hall to author, letter, 13 December 2003, describes the book as "a privately published Wells family history done in the early 1930s by members of my great aunt's (Cynthia Wells Carson) family living at the time in South Dakota. Cynthia was a granddaughter of Rhoda Pugh Wells and a great-granddaughter of David Pugh . . . A lot of the Pugh information was furnished by my great aunt Martha Wells Sebastian (sister of Cynthia)."

30. For an analysis of the errors, see Karen Stewart, Bartow, Fla., to author, letter, 30 November 2004, who writes: "Typos include 'Rodah, Vilet, and Robbert' for Rhoda, Violet, and Robert and 'BiBg Wilson Vreek' for Big Wilson Creek, probably sloppy typesetting as they are spelled correctly in other sections."

31. Phyllis Parker to author, undated letter received on 15 January 1999. Ms. Parker circulated photocopies from the book among Pugh researchers.

32. *John Wells and Descendants*, 4.

33. See Hall to author, letter, 14 April 2004.

34. *DeKalb County Herald*, Butler, Mo., 1 March 1906, Robert T. Pugh obituary. Robert apparently was Franklin's son. See 1860 U.S. census, Clinton Co. Mo., population schedule, Lafayette Twp., p. 24, dwelling/family 162, Franklin Pugh household; NA microfilm M653, roll 615. Also, 1870 U.S. census, Clinton Co., Mo., pop. sch., Lafayette Twp., p. 74, dwell./fam. 31, Franklin Pugh household; NA microfilm M593, roll 771.

*Descendants*.<sup>35</sup> The gravestone date probably came from the family Bible, which lists Franklin as “Benjamin F. Pugh” with that date and suggests his full name was “Benjamin Franklin Pugh.”<sup>36</sup> On 23 July 1833 Franklin married Elizabeth Shupe in Smyth County, Virginia.<sup>37</sup>

Also in Smyth County George W. Pugh married Martha Kirk on 29 July 1834.<sup>38</sup> A family Bible records “G. W.” Pugh’s birth on 6 May 1813, matching that of “Washington P. Minton” in *John Wells and Descendants*.<sup>39</sup> The name “Nancy” appears inside the Bible’s front cover. George apparently did not write either entry.<sup>40</sup> In 1845 “Washington Pugh” bought tools at a Claiborne County estate sale, and “George W. Pugh” paid.<sup>41</sup> This suggests “George Washington Pugh” was called “Washington,” like “Washington P. Minton” in *John Wells and Descendants*. In 1850 he lived in the county where David Pugh and Nancy Minton had resided.<sup>42</sup>

Other records link George and Franklin Pugh to each other and to children of David Pugh and his wife, Sarah:

35. Antioch Cemetery (outside Gower, Mo., near where southbound Highway 169 enters Clinton County, Mo.), Franklin Pugh–Elizabeth Pugh gravestone; photograph, spring 2000, by Jerry T. Griggs, St. Joseph, Mo.; copy in author’s files. For Franklin the marker says “Born Feb. 9, 1807 [and] Died Jan. 14, 1886.”

36. David Lee Pugh family Bible record, in *The Complete Domestic Bible – containing the Old and New Testaments together with the Apocrypha, Concordance, and Psalms of David in Metre . . .* (Philadelphia: Domestic Bible Publishing); photocopies from Jack Querry, Oklahoma City, Okla., to author. The Bible does not contain a copyright or publication date. Mr. Querry to author, e-mail, 27 January 2005, describes the Bible’s provenance: “I received it from Audrea (Marriott) Thompson of Slaton, Texas prior to her death on 27 Sept. 1993. Audrea was my 1st cousin once removed. She was the daughter of Dollie Esther (Pugh) Marriott. Dollie was my grandaunt and daughter of David L. & Mary F. (Whitson) Pugh. Audrea received the Bible from her mother when she passed away 9 Nov 1970 at Slaton, Texas.”

37. Smyth Co., Va., Marriage Register, 1832–1915, p. 2, Pugh–Shupe marriage bond, 18 July 1833; County Clerk, Marion, Va.; FHL microfilm 33,990.

38. Smyth Co. Marriage Register, 1832–1915, p. 4, Pugh–Kirk marriage bond (28 July 1834).

39. George W. Pugh family Bible record, in *Holy Bible, Containing the Old and New Testaments: Translated out of the Original Tongues and with the Former Translations Diligently Compared and Revised* (New York: A. Paul, 1826); owned by David Clyde Pugh (Howard City, Mich.). Janet Sikkenga, Houston, Tex., to author, e-mail, 29 September 2004, describes the Bible’s provenance: George W. Pugh to his son, Andrew Jackson Pugh; Andrew Jackson Pugh to his daughter Stella (Pugh) Ehrensperger. Stella “gave the Bible to my mother, Faye Pearl (Emery) Pugh . . . ; then the Bible went from Faye Pearl (Emery) Pugh to her son David Clyde Pugh where it now remains.”

40. For George’s handwriting, see Pugh and wife to Dunn, original deed, 24 January 1881; reportedly “found in a box of documents in the Monroe County, Indiana, courthouse [Bloomington, Ind.];” photocopy in author’s files. See Sikkenga to author, letter, March 2006, conveying the photocopy.

41. Claiborne Co. Inventories and Settlements of Estates, 1839–50, pp. 74–76, John Jones estate sale record, 21 August 1845; Probate Court, Tazewell, Tenn.; FHL microfilm 898,392.

42. 1850 U.S. census, Claiborne Co., Tenn., pop. sch., Subdivision 7, p. 273, dwell./fam. 518, Geo. W. Pugh; NA microfilm M432, roll 874.



- On 19 December 1837 George and Franklin Pugh purchased personal effects from John Nelson's estate in Smyth County.<sup>43</sup>
- Franklin Pugh named his first son David, and George named his second son David—suggesting David Pugh was their father.<sup>44</sup>
- Susanna (Pugh) Williams, Samuel Pugh, and John Pugh—children of David and Sarah Pugh—also lived in Smyth County.<sup>45</sup>
- In 1838 George Pugh purchased sheep at William Pugh's estate sale in Grayson County, Virginia.<sup>46</sup> William was David and Sarah Pugh's eldest son.<sup>47</sup>
- In 1840 George W. Pugh lived in the Wilson Creek neighborhood of Grayson County, among Pugh family members and where David had owned land.<sup>48</sup>
- A descendant of Benjamin Franklin Pugh has perfect and near-perfect Y-chromosome DNA matches to descendants of William and Robert Pugh, two sons of David and Sarah. See table 1. The near-perfect matches are one-“point” differences—meaning “tightly related” descendants of the same man provided the DNA samples that were tested.<sup>49</sup>

The George W. Pugh family moved from Claiborne County, Tennessee, to Monroe County, Indiana, before 1860. “Lovona” Pugh, age thirty-eight and born in Tennessee, lived with them that year.<sup>50</sup> Her age resembles that of Lovina

---

43. Smyth Co. Will Book A:146 and 148, John Nelson estate sale; County Court, Marion, Va.; FHL microfilm 33,976.

44. Franklin's son David Lee Pugh was born 9 July 1835 in Smyth Co., Va.; George's son David Colyer Pugh was born 6 August 1846 in Culpeper Co., Va. See David Lee Pugh and George W. Pugh family Bible records.

45. David named his children when he put his Virginia property into a trust for them, and he identified his daughter Susanna as Levi Williams's wife. See Grayson Co. Deed Book 2:227–28, Pew to his children, 27 August 1806. For their birth order, see *John Wells and Descendants*, 4–5. For Susanna's residence in Smyth Co., see 1860 U.S. census, Smyth Co., Va., pop. sch., Seven Mile Ford post office, p. 1042, dwell. 1185, fam. 1188, Susanna Williams; NA microfilm M653, roll 1377. For Samuel, see—for example—Smyth County Deeds 1:510, Pugh to James, 1 August 1836; County Clerk, Marion, Va; FHL microfilm 33,980. For John, see Smyth Co. Deeds 2:131, Pugh to James, 12 September 1837; FHL microfilm 33,980.

46. Grayson Co. Will Book 1:514–22, William Pugh estate sale account; FHL microfilm 31,741.

47. Grayson Co. Deed Book 2:227–28, Pew to his children, 27 August 1806. *John Wells and Descendants*, 4–5.

48. 1840 U.S. census, Grayson Co., Va., Western District, p. 304, George W. Pugh; NA microfilm M704, roll 556. Wythe Co. Deed Book 1:103, Cox to Pew, 1 May 1792, describes David's land as “on Wilson Creek.”

49. For interpretation of the relationship these test results imply, see “Interpreting Genetic Distance within Surname Projects,” *Family Tree DNA* ([http://www.familytreedna.com/GDRules\\_37.html](http://www.familytreedna.com/GDRules_37.html) and [http://www.familytreedna.com/gdrules\\_67.html](http://www.familytreedna.com/gdrules_67.html) : accessed 10 February 2008).

50. 1860 U.S. census, Monroe Co., Ind., pop. sch., Bean Blossom, p. 635, dwell./fam. 148, Geo. W. Pugh household; NA microfilm M653, roll 282.

Table 1

## Comparison of Test Results for Three Y-Chromosome DNA Samples

DONOR OF SAMPLE	SEGMENTS TESTED			
	MARKERS 1-12	MARKERS 13-25	MARKERS 26-37	MARKERS 38-67
Descendant of Robert Pugh <sup>a</sup>	match	match	1 difference	match
Descendant of William Pugh <sup>b</sup>	match	match	match	[not tested]
Descendant of Franklin Pugh <sup>c</sup>	match	1 difference	match	match

Notes: The Robert Pugh sample differs from the other two at the location labeled DNA Y-chromosome sequence (DYS) 570. The Franklin Pugh sample differs from the other two at location DYS 458.

Robert and William Pugh were children of David and Sarah Pugh. See Grayson Co., Va., Deed Book 2:227-28, Pew to his children, 27 August 1806; County Court, Independence, Va.; microfilm 31,746, Family History Library, Salt Lake City. Along with sources and discussion in the text, the test results suggest Franklin also was David's son.

Results, including links to the complete haplotypes, are part of Daniela Moneta and Jeff Pugh, admins., "Pugh Surname DNA Project," *FamilyTreeDNA* (<http://www.familytreedna.com/public/Pugh/>; accessed 10 February 2008). See also Jeff Pugh and Daniela Moneta, "The Pugh Surname DNA Project," *RootsWeb* (<http://freepages.genealogy.rootsweb.com/~pughdna/>; accessed 10 February 2008).

a. FamilyTreeDNA (Houston, Texas), "Y-Chromosome DNA 67 Marker Report, Kit N28945," for George F. Pugh, Kidder, Mo., 26 May 2006.

b. FamilyTreeDNA, "Y-Chromosome DNA 37 Marker Report, Kit 78394," for Raymond Samuel Pugh, Summerfield, Fla., 16 January 2007.

c. FamilyTreeDNA, "Y-Chromosome DNA 67 Marker Report, Kit N30705," for John W. Pugh, St. Joseph, Mo., 21 June 2006.

Minton, who lived in Hancock County, Tennessee, in 1850.<sup>51</sup> She may have been George's apparent younger sister, "Sevinak P. Minton," listed in *John Wells and Descendants*. George gave one of his daughters the middle name Lavina.<sup>52</sup>

## SUMMARY OF EVIDENCE

Benjamin Franklin Pugh and George Washington Pugh appear in places and times fitting children of David Pugh and Nancy Minton. No information

51. 1850 U.S. census, Hancock Co., Tenn., pop. sch., Subdivision 33, p. 60, dwell./fam. 486, Lovina Minton; NA microfilm M432, roll 881. Also in the household are William Minton, age seventeen, and Mary Jane Minton, age two.

52. Rachael Lavina Pugh was born 28 July 1849 in Claiborne Co., Tenn. See George W. Pugh family Bible record.

implies they were not “Franklin Pugh Minton” and “Washington P. Minton” listed in *John Wells and Descendants*. Nor does any source suggest they were not children of Nancy Minton and David Pugh, who left his wife and children before Franklin’s and Washington’s births. Furthermore, eight points support the theory that Benjamin Franklin Pugh, George Washington Pugh, and “Sevinak” P. Minton were Nancy and David’s children:

- Birthdates of Benjamin Franklin Pugh and George Washington Pugh match those of Franklin Pugh Minton and Washington P. Minton.
- Franklin Pugh and George W. Pugh married one year apart in the same county and appear there together on an estate bill of sale.
- Franklin and Washington lived in the same counties as some of David and Sarah Pugh’s children and interacted with them.
- The name “Nancy” in George Washington Pugh’s Bible may refer to Nancy Minton, apparent mother of “Washington P. Minton.”
- George Washington Pugh lived in the Tennessee county where David Pugh and Nancy Minton had settled.
- The names David and Lavina appear among George’s and Franklin’s children.
- “Lovona Pugh” possibly one of David and Nancy’s daughters, moved with George Pugh to Indiana.
- DNA evidence shows a male-line descendant of Franklin closely related to male-line descendants of David and his wife.

These points suggest that Elizabeth P. Minton—listed with Franklin, Washington, and “Sevinak” Minton in *John Wells and Descendants*—also was a child of David Pugh and Nancy Minton.

## CONCLUSION

Franklin Pugh Minton aka Benjamin Franklin Pugh was born about six months after David and Nancy’s arrest, suggesting their relationship started before May 1806. At the time Nancy may already have had two daughters, five-year-old Thirza and one-year-old Polly. Sarah apparently discovered the affair, and in August 1806 David and Nancy were arrested. David quickly put his Virginia property in trust for his wife and children and left for “remote parts” to start a new life and family with Nancy.

Because Sarah and David did not divorce, he was not free to marry Nancy. Conventionally, the children of an unmarried woman use her surname.<sup>53</sup>

---

53. Noel C. Stevenson, *Genealogical Evidence: A Guide to the Standard of Proof Relating to Pedigrees, Ancestry, Heirship and Family History* (Laguna Hills, Calif.: Aegean Park Press, 1979), 24.

Nevertheless, Nancy's sons took on the Pugh surname. Nancy, however, used Minton before David's death and Minton and Pugh afterwards.<sup>54</sup>

The source of Minton information in *John Wells and Descendants* remains uncertain. Virginia did not require birth records until 1853.<sup>55</sup> The Minton birth information may have come from one or more family Bibles. In 1779 David's father, Samuel Pugh, bequeathed him a "great Bible."<sup>56</sup> Perhaps a descendant recorded the births of Minton relatives, creating a source for the anonymous compiler of *John Wells and Descendants*.

Although no known record specifies children for David Pugh and Nancy Minton, the indirect evidence seems clear. Unmarried, David and Nancy were parents of Franklin Pugh Minton aka Benjamin Franklin Pugh, Elizabeth P. Minton, Washington P. Minton aka George Washington Pugh, and Sevinak P. Minton (probably Lovina Minton aka Lovona Pugh). Without *John Wells and Descendants*—an unattributed and undocumented genealogical compilation—this conclusion may have been impossible to achieve.

---

54. For before David's death, see Claiborne Co. Deed Book C:153–55, Pugh to Minton, 30 January 1822. For afterward, see 1830 U.S. census, Claiborne Co., Tenn., p. 121, Nancy Pugh; and 1840 U.S. census, Claiborne Co., Tenn., p. 235A, Nancy Minton.

55. "Vital Statistics (Marriage, Birth, Death Records)," *Library of Virginia* (<http://www.lva.lib.va.us/whatwehave/vital/index.htm> : accessed 3 February 2008).

56. Loudoun Co. Book of Partially Proven Wills, p. 59, Samuel Pugh Will; Courthouse, Leesburg, Va. Of this Bible, Hall to author, in letter, 13 December 2003, says "We (the Va Pughs) always thought they [South Dakota relatives] had the Pugh Bible and they (the Western Pugh descendants) thought we did. None of us had it and it has never surfaced. A lot of the Pugh information was furnished by my great aunt Martha Wells Sebastian (sister of Cynthia), so we finally assumed that she had access to this info but it was either lost [or] destroyed? She died in 1940 at the age of 90."

---

## UPDATE

### Abstracts of Revolutionary War Pension Applications

NGS *Quarterly* 29 (December 1941): 133. The abstracted date of John Poland's court appearance to create an affidavit for his pension application should be "July 25, 1820" (not "May 25, 1820"). The original document reports his age as "about" sixty-six. The editors thank William Wolf of Eatonton, New Jersey, for the correction.